

Town of Derry



17840016

Department DPW Highway Division	Vendor Name: Northland JCB	Batch No.
Requisitioner: Alan R. Cote Supt. of Operations	Vendor Address: 44 Locke Rd Concord, NH 03301	Vendor No. 113124

☐ State Bid
 ☐ Sole Source
 ☒ Formal Bid
 ☐ Verbal/Written Quotes

QUANTITY	DESCRIPTION	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL
1	4CX 14 JCB Loader Backhoe	\$ 113,000.00	\$113,000.00
1	Material handling forks	\$ 2,450.00	\$2,450.00
1	Additional cutting edge for bucket	\$ 490.00	\$490.00
5	extra teeth for backhoe bucket	\$ 11.00	\$55.00
1	Spare tire with rim	\$ 3,500.00	\$3,500.00
1	6 in 1 bucket included	\$ -	\$0.00
1	Tool carrier included	\$ -	\$0.00
1	5 year extended warranty	\$ 5,763.48	\$5,763.48
Shipping (10% est.)			
Requisition Total			\$125,258.48

(Attach all supporting documentation)

Quote /Bid Information:

See attached.

Description of Purchase:

Account No: Division- Org. No: 18432002 Object No: 740000 Project :

Requisitioner Signature: Alan R. Cote Date: 10 August 2016
Alan R. Cote, Supt. of Operations

Department Approval: _____ Date: _____

8/16/16

After further review/feedback, I concur with the recommendation. I would like to take the 5 yr. Extended warranty option. Can you confirm that the warranty is \$5,763 total or \$5,763 annually = \$28k.

Memorandum

MM16-049

Mike

To: Mike Fowler P.E., Director
From: Alan Cote, Supt of Operations, Derry, N H
Date: August 5, 2016
Re: Loader/Backhoe Evaluation and Recommendation

I have completed a further evaluation of the proposals submitted to the Town of Derry for a loader/backhoe received as a result of an RFP (request for proposal) which was opened on Friday, July 15, 2016. Initially, I selected the Caterpillar 420IT based on the information provided regarding each machine. After further questioning, it was determined that even though the JCB did not have a DPF (Diesel Particulate Filter) it still meets Interim Tier 4 emissions. This increased the rating for "Meets/Exceeds Specifications" to 9 instead of 4. I also increased JCB's rating for "Responsible per RFP General Terms and Conditions" because they provided the Town of Derry with a machine to try for a few days. I asked Caterpillar to provide the same and have not heard back from them in a week. Lastly, I increased the rating for "Dealer Proximity to Derry". Given that the difference in mileage from the Caterpillar Dealer to the JCB Dealer is only about 20 miles difference, I determined that the distance did not warrant a 50 point spread between machines. Attached you will find evaluation forms for each of the units that the Town received proposals for.

Ratings were given in ten categories with a scale from 0 – 10. Upon tabulating the results, the JCB 4CX – 14 ranked the highest with 585 points followed by the Caterpillar 420F2 IT with 575 points. The next three proposals were very close with rankings of 505 for both the JCB 3CX – 15 and the JCB 3CX – 14 and a rating of 500 for the Case 580SN WT.

A summary the highlights and pitfalls of the various proposals are as follows. JCB met all the specifications with the exception of only having one auxiliary 12V power plug instead of two. Caterpillar met all the specifications in the RFP with the exception of not providing a parts manual in an electronic format. The JCB 4CX-14 was demonstrated and was capable of loading the sanders in the event of a breakdown of the loader. Caterpillar was slightly heavier and offered the greatest variety of warranty options, but at a price. The Case backhoe was actually under the minimum 98 HP requested in the specification. Historically, the Town of Derry had issues with warranty work on the Case loader purchased from Beauregard Equipment.

August 5, 2016

Northland JCB allowed the Town of Derry to demo' the machine and my most seasoned operators were very impressed with the power, responsiveness, and ergonomics on the machine. I spoke with Milton Cat about getting a demo' from them and they have not delivered.

The total cost for the JCB would be \$119,495.00 including the material forks, additional cutting edge, extra teeth for the backhoe bucket, and spare wheel and tire. An extended warranty is available for an annual cost of \$5,763.48 for 5 years or 5000 hours covering the full machine. The standard coverage is two years/2000 hours.

In conclusion, I am now recommending purchasing the JCB4CX-14 from Northland JCB of Concord, NH.

Cc: File

ATTACHMENT A

PROPOSAL EVALUATION FORM

FIRM: Northland JCB 4CX - 14

DATE: July 18, 2016

PROJECT: LOADER BACKHOE

DEPARTMENT/DIVISION: DERRY PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

RATING CATEGORY	WEIGHT	RATING	SCORE
Proposal:			
Responsive - Required Documents Submitted	5	5	25
Cost	10	9	90
Delivery Time After Receipt of Order	10	9	90
Equipment:			
Meets/Exceeds Specifications	10	9	90
Warranties	10	6	60
Manufacturer's Stated Fuel Consumption	10	5	50
Country of Origin (extra points for units made in USA)	5	5	25
Firm:			
Record of Satisfactory Performance	10	5	50
Dealer Proximity to Derry (for parts & service)	10	7	70
Responsible (per RFP General Terms & Conditions)	5	7	35
Total:			585

Rating Scale: Unacceptable 0, Average 5, Excellent 10

ATTACHMENT A**PROPOSAL EVALUATION FORM**FIRM: Milton Cat Caterpillar 420F2 ITDATE: July 18, 2016PROJECT: LOADER BACKHOEDEPARTMENT/DIVISION: DERRY PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

RATING CATEGORY	WEIGHT	RATING	SCORE
Proposal:			
Responsive - Required Documents Submitted	5	5	25
Cost	10	5	50
Delivery Time After Receipt of Order	10	6	60
Equipment:			
Meets/Exceeds Specifications	10	9	90
Warranties	10	7	70
Manufacturer's Stated Fuel Consumption	10	4	40
Country of Origin (extra points for units made in USA)	5	5	25
Firm:			
Record of Satisfactory Performance	10	9	90
Dealer Proximity to Derry (for parts & service)	10	10	100
Responsible (per RFP General Terms & Conditions)	5	5	25
Total:			575

Rating Scale: Unacceptable 0, Average 5, Excellent 10

ATTACHMENT A**PROPOSAL EVALUATION FORM**FIRM: Northland JCB 3CX - 14DATE: July 18, 2016PROJECT: LOADER BACKHOEDEPARTMENT/DIVISION: DERRY PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

RATING CATEGORY	WEIGHT	RATING	SCORE
Proposal:			
Responsive - Required Documents Submitted	5	5	25
Cost	10	9	90
Delivery Time After Receipt of Order	10	9	90
Equipment:			
Meets/Exceeds Specifications	10	3	30
Warranties	10	5	50
Manufacturer's Stated Fuel Consumption	10	5	50
Country of Origin (extra points for units made in USA)	5	5	25
Firm:			
Record of Satisfactory Performance	10	5	50
Dealer Proximity to Derry (for parts & service)	10	7	70
Responsible (per RFP General Terms & Conditions)	5	5	25
Total:			505

Rating Scale: Unacceptable 0, Average 5, Excellent 10

ATTACHMENT A**PROPOSAL EVALUATION FORM**FIRM: Northland JCB 3CX - 15DATE: July 18, 2016PROJECT: LOADER BACKHOEDEPARTMENT/DIVISION: DERRY PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

RATING CATEGORY	WEIGHT	RATING	SCORE
Proposal:			
Responsive - Required Documents Submitted	5	5	25
Cost	10	9	90
Delivery Time After Receipt of Order	10	9	90
Equipment:			
Meets/Exceeds Specifications	10	3	30
Warranties	10	5	50
Manufacturer's Stated Fuel Consumption	10	5	50
Country of Origin (extra points for units made in USA)	5	5	25
Firm:			
Record of Satisfactory Performance	10	5	50
Dealer Proximity to Derry (for parts & service)	10	7	70
Responsible (per RFP General Terms & Conditions)	5	5	25
Total:			505

Rating Scale: Unacceptable 0, Average 5, Excellent 10

ATTACHMENT A**PROPOSAL EVALUATION FORM**FIRM: Case 580SN WTDATE: July 18, 2016PROJECT: LOADER BACKHOEDEPARTMENT/DIVISION: DERRY PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

RATING CATEGORY	WEIGHT	RATING	SCORE
Proposal:			
Responsive - Required Documents Submitted	5	5	25
Cost	10	9	90
Delivery Time After Receipt of Order	10	6	60
Equipment:			
Meets/Exceeds Specifications	10	3	30
Warranties	10	5	70
Manufacturer's Stated Fuel Consumption	10	6	60
Country of Origin (extra points for units made in USA)	5	8	40
Firm:			
Record of Satisfactory Performance	10	3	30
Dealer Proximity to Derry (for parts & service)	10	7	70
Responsible (per RFP General Terms & Conditions)	5	5	25
Total:			500

Rating Scale: Unacceptable 0, Average 5, Excellent 10

Contact: Michael A Fowler, P.E., Director
Public Works Director Municipal Center
Phone: 603-432-6100 14 Manning Street
Fax: 603-432-6130 Derry, NH 03038

**Town of Derry
Office of the
Public Works Office**

Legal Notice

ACCEPTANCE DUE DATE: **July 15, 2016** **2:00 p.m. Local time**

ACCEPTANCE PLACE Public Works Office – 2nd Floor
Derry Municipal Center
14 Manning Street
Derry, NH 03038

Sealed Envelopes Must Be Marked: **LOADER BACKHOE**

Bid Specifications and details are available:

Derry Public Work's Office, 2nd Floor, M-F, 7am - 4pm
Town of Derry Website: <http://www.derry.nh.us/bids-rfps>

Requests for information related to this request should be directed to:

Alan Cote, Supt. of Operation
Email: alancote@derrynh.org

Town of Derry - Department of Public Works
(603) 432-6144